## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

PASQUALE BARONE	)
V.	) Civ. No. 98-11104-MLW
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	)
VINCENT FERRARA	)
V.	) Civ. No. 00-11693-MLW
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	)
	ORDER

WOLF, D.J. April 28, 2009

Attached is an April 23, 2009 letter from the court to Attorney General Eric H. Holder. The attachments to the letter may be obtained from the court files in these cases.

/s/ MARK L. WOLF
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

April 23, 2009

## BY FEDERAL EXPRESS

The Honorable Eric H. Holder Attorney General of the United States United States Department of Justice 950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Room 4400 Washington, D.C. 20530

Attention: <u>Annie Bradley</u>

Dear Attorney General Holder:

Thank you for your remarks on April 21, 2009, to the Chief Judges of the United States District Courts. We appreciate your determination to assure that Department of Justice attorneys perform their duties honorably and ably, and to take seriously any failure to do so. I am writing in response to your request that we communicate with you directly if we encounter the type of problem you wish to address.

Enclosed is my January 2, 2008 letter, with attachments, to Attorney General Michael Mukasey. As you will see, it describes the disciplinary proceedings I initiated in 2007 against an Assistant United States Attorney because of the Department of Justice's inadequate response to his misconduct in failing to disclose material exculpatory information that the Court of Appeals for the Circuit characterized as "blatant," "manipulative," "deliberate," and "outrageous." Ferrara v. United States, 456 F.3d 278, 293 (1st Cir. 2006). That misconduct required me to order the release from prison of a Capo and an Associate of the Patriarca Family of La Cosa Nostra. <u>See Ferrara v. United</u> <u>States</u>, 384 F. Supp. 2d 384 (D. Mass. 2005).

As explained in my attached December 8, 2006 letter to Attorney General Alberto Gonzales, the misconduct that resulted in the release of the defendants was part of a long pattern of similar misconduct by the same prosecutor. As explained in my attached June 29, 2007 letter to Attorney General Gonzales, my January 2, 2008 letter to Attorney General Mukasey, and my attached January 2, 2008 letter to Associate Deputy Attorney General David Margolis,

the "sanction" for the extreme and intentional misconduct found by me and by the First Circuit was a secret, written reprimand by the United States Attorney for the District of Massachusetts who, before and after issuing it, publicly praised the prosecutor.

In my letter to Attorney General Mukasey I wrote that:

the Department's performance in the [referenced] matter raises serious questions about whether judges should continue to rely upon the Department to investigate and sanction misconduct by federal prosecutors. As one who took pride in assisting Attorney General Edward Levi in establishing [the Office of Professional Responsibility] more than thirty years ago, I sadly doubt that it is now capable of serving its intended purpose.

Judge Emmet G. Sullivan's recent appointment of a special counsel to investigate and possibly prosecute high ranking Department of Justice lawyers for contempt in the <u>Stevens</u> case confirms that other judges share my concern.

As the <u>Stevens</u> case also indicates, prosecutorial misconduct is neither a rare nor merely historical problem. As I recently wrote in the enclosed decision in <u>United States v. Jones</u>, "[t]he egregious failure of the government to disclose [in 2008] plainly material exculpatory evidence in [<u>Jones</u>] extends a dismal history of intentional and inadvertent violations of the government's duties to disclose in cases assigned to this court." 2009 WL 151587 at \*5 (D. Mass. Jan. 21, 2009). Nine noteworthy examples of such misconduct were cited. <u>Id.</u> at \*17-18.

In my letter to Attorney General Mukasey I also described the repeated failures of the Department of Justice to be candid and consistent with courts in matters arising from my 1999 decision finding extraordinary misconduct by members of the Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") concerning its informant James "Whitey" Bulger. See United States v. Salemme, 91 F. Supp. 2d 141 (D. Mass. 1999). For example, as described in detail in that letter, in the federal prosecution of FBI agent John Connolly the Department of Justice asserted that Connolly had told Bulger of individuals providing information against Bulger who were then, foreseeably, Connolly has been convicted of doing just that in a state court case in Florida that was prosecuted in part by a crossdesignated Assistant United States Attorney. In both criminal cases, the government presented the immunized testimony of Bulger's associate Kevin Weeks. Weeks received a federal sentence of only six years for committing five murders based on the Department of Justice's representation that Weeks had been completely truthful and provided substantial assistance. Nevertheless, in a series of

cases brought by the survivors of Bulger's victims, attorneys from the Civil Division of the Department of Justice have unsuccessfully argued that Connolly did not leak the lethal information to Bulger and have attempted to discredit Weeks' testimony on this issue.

My late colleague Judge Reginald Lindsay publicly urged the Department of Justice to settle the cases arising out of the FBI's misconduct concerning its informants. It has not done so. As a result, damages of more than \$100,000,000 have been awarded against the United States in two cases and the remaining six are scheduled to be tried before the end of this summer. As the attached articles indicate, the government's approach to the remaining wrongful death cases has recently provoked renewed public criticism of the Department of Justice. <u>See</u> Kevin Cullen, <u>Family Needs an</u> Advocate, Boston Globe, Mar. 23, 2009, at B1 ("[T]he Department of Justice tried to blame the victim. A pair of lawyers with nice suits and no scruples flew up from Washington and tried to sully Michael Donahue in the grave."); Kevin Cullen, Where is the Boston Globe, Apr. 13, 2009, at B1 (noting "[t]he Justice?, vindictative, unconscionable approach the government is taking with the Donahues"); Peter Gelzinis, <u>Heroic Ruling Stands</u>, <u>But Jury's</u> Still Out On Feds, Boston Herald, Apr. 15, 2009, at 10 (Judge Lindsay having died after finding the government liable but before awarding damages, "the government lawyers wanted to everything from scratch." Tommy Donahue "prepared himself to be betrayed by the government he loves.").

Attorney General Gonzales told me that he would look into these matters when I first raised them with him in June, 2006. I did not hear further from him. I concluded my January, 2008 letter to Attorney General Mukasey by stating that:

I expect that you have returned to the Department because, like so many former federal prosecutors, you retain a reverence for its mission. Therefore, I felt that I should bring these matters to your personal attention in the hope that, with your leadership, the recent past will not be prologue, and the Department will soon again discharge its duties in a manner that commands the trust of federal judges and the people of the United States.

However, I did not receive a response from Attorney General Mukasey either. Nevertheless, encouraged by the intentions and aspirations you expressed to the Chief Judges, and by your actions as Attorney General, I am sending this message to you with renewed hope.

With best wishes,

Sincerely yours,
/S/ Mark L. Wolf
Mark L. Wolf

## **Publisher Information**

Note\* This page is not part of the opinion as entered by the court.

The docket information provided on this page is for the benefit
of publishers of these opinions.

Plaintiff Pasquale G. Barone represented by Pasquale G. Barone 117766-038
U.S.P. Leavenworth
Leavenworth, TX 66048-1000
PRO SE

Alba Doto Baccari LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Bernard Grossberg Bernard Grossberg, Esq. 83 Atlantic Avenue Boston, MA 02110 617 737-8558 Fax: 617-737-8223 Email: bgrossberg@grossberglaw.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Debra A. DelVecchio DelVecchio & Houseman The Perry Building 15 Front Street Salem , MA 01970 978-740-5999 Fax: 978-740-9434 Email: dadelvecchio@verizon.net LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard M. Egbert Law Office of Richard M. Egbert 99 Summer Street Suite 1800 Boston , MA 02110 617-737-8222 Fax: 617-737-8223 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED Defendant USA represented by James F. Lang United States Attorney's Office Suite 9200 1 Courthouse Way Boston, MA 02210 617-748-3175 Fax: 617-748-3954

Email: james.lang@usdoj.gov LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James D. Herbert
United States Attorney's Office
1 Courthouse Way
Suite 9200
Boston , MA 02210
617-748-3100
Fax: 617-748-3963
Email: James.Herbert@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED Movant

Plaintiff Vincent M. Ferrara represented by David Z. Chesnoff Goodman & Chesnoff 520 S. 4th Street Las Vegas , NV 89101 702-384-5563 Email: fettor@aol.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David A. Nickerson 454 Las Gallinas Avenue Suite 183 San Rafael , CA 94903 415-507-9097 Fax: 415-507-9098 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martin G. Weinberg Martin G. Weinberg, PC 20 Park Plaza Suite 1000 Boston , MA 02116 617-227-3700 Fax: 617-338-9538 Email: owlmcb@att.net LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert M. Goldstein
20 Park Plaza, Suite 1000
Boston, MA 02116
617-742-9015
Fax: 617-742-9016
Email: rmg@goldstein-lawfirm.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED
V.
Defendant USA represented by James D. Herbert
United States Attorney's Office
John Joseph Moakley Federal Courthouse

1 Courthouse Way Suite 9200 Boston , MA 02210 617-748-3100 Fax: 617-748-3963

Email: James.Herbert@usdoj.gov

**LEAD ATTORNEY** 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James F. Lang
United States Attorney's Office
Suite 9200
1 Courthouse Way
Boston , MA 02210
617-748-3175
Fax: 617-748-3954
Email: james.lang@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert E. Richardson United States Attorney's Office Suite 9200 1 Courthouse Way Boston, MA 02210 617-748-3247 Fax: 617-748-3951

Email: robert.richardson@usdoj.gov

**LEAD ATTORNEY** 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED Movant